JNphi

Evolution of Brains and Minds: A Comprehensive Critical Assessment. Gerhard Roth (Author). Springer · Dordrecht · 2013

Anita M. Rosenberg

Abstract

Gerhard Roth's *Evolution of Brains and Minds* represents a rare and valuable achievement in the neurological and evolutionary literature. It is rare because its author brings an almost unprecedented combination of disciplinary training to bear on the central problem of the mind-brain relationship: Roth holds doctorates in both philosophy and biology (specifically behavioral physiology and neurobiology), and his career has bridged the humanities and natural sciences in ways that few contemporary researchers can claim. It is valuable because it offers a comprehensive, empirically grounded, and philosophically informed synthesis of what is currently known—and what remains unknown—about how nervous systems and cognitive capacities have evolved across the animal kingdom, culminating in the peculiar case of *Homo sapiens*. This extended review provides a chapter-by-chapter analysis, identifies major themes, assesses strengths and weaknesses, and evaluates the book's lasting significance.

Key Words: Evolution of nervous systems; comparative neurobiology; consciousness; animal cognition; mind-brain problem; encephalization; human uniqueness; language evolution; non-reductive physicalism.

DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.23119122

I. Introduction: A Magisterial Synthesis from an Uncommon Perspective

Gerhard Roth's *Evolution of Brains and Minds* represents a rare and valuable achievement in the neurological and evolutionary literature. It is rare because its author brings an almost unprecedented combination of disciplinary training to bear on the central problem of the mind-brain relationship: Roth holds doctorates in both philosophy and biology (specifically behavioral physiology and neurobiology), and

Corresponding author: Anita M. Rosenberg, Department of Philosophy, Faculty of Arts and Humanities, 214 Kowhai Terrace, Christchurch 8041, New Zealand
Address: Independent Researcher and Philosopher
e-mail. anita.Ros@ac.nz

his career has bridged the humanities and natural sciences in ways that few contemporary researchers can claim. It is valuable because it offers a comprehensive, empirically grounded, and philosophically informed synthesis of what is currently known—and what remains unknown—about how nervous systems and cognitive capacities have evolved across the animal kingdom, culminating in the peculiar case of *Homo sapiens*. The book is an English translation and substantial revision of Roth's 2010 German work *Wie einzigartig ist der Mensch? Die lange Evolution der Gehirne und des Geistes* ("How Unique Is Humanity? The Long Evolution of Brains and Minds"). Rather than a mere translation, the author has taken the opportunity to incorporate new literature that appeared between the German and English editions, revise several chapters extensively, and refine his arguments in light of ongoing debates. The result is a work that stands as a landmark contribution to evolutionary neurobiology, comparative cognition, and the philosophy of mind.

II. The Author's Intellectual Trajectory: Philosophy, Biology, and the Mind-Brain Problem

Roth's preface is unusually revealing about the intellectual formation that shaped his approach. As a philosophy student at the University of Münster in the mid-1960s, he found himself deeply dissatisfied with the historicist orientation of his department. The prevailing approach was to learn what various philosophers had said about perception, mind, and reasoning—when they said it, and perhaps why—but not whether their theories were *true* in any empirical sense. Natural scientists, including psychologists, were regarded with contempt by many philosophers. In this environment, Roth attended a public lecture by the renowned zoologist and evolutionary biologist Bernhard Rensch (1900–1990), who spoke on the relationship between cognitive functions and the evolution of nervous systems and brains.

Rensch's lecture was a revelation. Here was a natural scientist addressing the very questions that philosophy claimed as its own—the reliability of perception, the possibility of certain knowledge, the nature and origin of mind—but doing so within a framework that could, at least in principle, yield answers rather than merely cataloguing opinions. Rensch, who had himself studied philosophy alongside biology, advised the young Roth to complete his philosophy degree and then begin a second degree in the natural sciences. Roth took this advice, completing a doctorate in philosophy (on Antonio Gramsci) in 1969 before returning to Münster to study biology. He subsequently earned a second doctorate in behavioral physiology and neurobiology, conducted postdoctoral research with the eminent evolutionary biologist David B. Wake at the University of California, Berkeley, and eventually became professor of behavioral physiology at the newly founded University of Bremen in 1976.

This unusual intellectual biography explains the distinctive character of Roth's approach to the mind-brain problem. Unlike many neuroscientists who dismiss philosophy as irrelevant speculation, or many philosophers who regard neuroscience as incapable of addressing genuinely philosophical questions, Roth takes both disciplines seriously. He is well-versed in the philosophical literature on dualism, monism, emergence, reductionism, and panpsychism, and he brings this philosophical sophistication to bear on the interpretation of empirical data. At the same time, he is a rigorous empiricist who insists that philosophical claims about the mind must be constrained by what we actually know about the evolution and functioning of nervous systems.

III. Overview and Structure

The book is organized into seventeen chapters, plus an extensive bibliography and index. The chapters can be grouped thematically into several sections: Foundations (Chapters 1–3); Life and Neurons (Chapters 4–5); Evolution of Nervous Systems across Invertebrates and Deuterostomes (Chapters 6–9); Vertebrate Brains and Sensory Systems (Chapters 10–11); Comparative Cognition and Brain Structure (Chapters 12–14); Human Uniqueness (Chapter 15); Determinants of Brain and Mind Evolution (Chapter 16); and Brains and Minds (Chapter 17).

Chapter Overview: Chapters 1–3 define key concepts; Chapters 4–5 cover neuronal fundamentals; Chapters 6–9 survey invertebrate nervous systems; Chapters 10–11 detail vertebrate neuroanatomy; Chapters 12–14 examine comparative cognition and consciousness; Chapter 15 addresses human uniqueness; Chapter 16 synthesizes evolutionary determinants; Chapter 17 returns to the mind-brain problem.

IV. Selected Chapter Highlights

Chapter 2: Mind and Intelligence

Roth defines "mind" broadly to include all cognitive capacities (learning, memory, problem-solving, behavioral flexibility) rather than limiting it to conscious experience. He distinguishes non-associative learning (habituation, sensitization) from associative learning (classical Pavlovian conditioning, operant conditioning), and addresses more complex forms such as imitation and insight. The discussion of consciousness is particularly nuanced: Roth notes that while we cannot directly access the subjective experience of other beings, we can make inferences based on behavior and neural activity. He surveys philosophical positions on the mind-brain problem—dualism, emergentism, eliminative materialism, identity theory,

supervenience, non-reductive physicalism, and panpsychism—and expresses sympathy for a form of non-reductive physicalism.

Chapter 5: The Language of Neurons

This chapter provides a detailed but accessible introduction to neurophysiology: neuronal structure, resting membrane potential, action potentials, ion channels, synaptic transmission, neurotransmitters, and neuromodulators. Roth distinguishes fast ionotropic transmission from slower metabotropic transmission, and discusses principles of neuronal information processing: spatial and temporal summation, convergence and divergence, excitation and inhibition, and neural plasticity.

Chapter 6: Bacteria, Archaea, Protozoa: Successful Life Without a Nervous System

Roth demonstrates that even the simplest organisms possess sophisticated information-processing capabilities. *Escherichia coli* can detect chemical gradients, move toward attractants and away from repellents, and possesses a short-term memory of a few seconds. Protozoans exhibit even more complex behavior: *Paramecium* shows habituation and sensitization; *Chlamydomonas* has a primitive visual system based on channelrhodopsins. The chapter is a powerful corrective to the assumption that complex behavior requires a nervous system.

Chapters 7–8: Invertebrate Nervous Systems and Cognition

Roth surveys the diversity of invertebrate nervous systems, from cnidarian nerve nets to the complex brains of cephalopods and arthropods. The octopus brain contains approximately 42 million neurons in the brain proper plus another 350 million in the arms, with the vertical lobe—involved in learning and memory—having an astonishingly regular structure. Honeybees, with only about 1 million neurons, can learn associative tasks, categorical learning, and show evidence of selective attention and quantity discrimination. These cases demonstrate that complex cognition can be implemented in very different neural substrates.

Chapters 12–14: Comparative Cognition and Brain Structure

Roth challenges Euan MacPhail's claim that all vertebrates are equally intelligent under "fair" conditions, presenting extensive evidence for significant differences across groups. Teleost fish, amphibians, reptiles, birds, and mammals show a mosaic pattern of cognitive evolution. The most intelligent non-human animals—great apes, some monkeys, corvids, parrots, dolphins, elephants—have cognitive abilities comparable to those of a 3- to 5-year-old human child. The best predictors of high cognitive ability are: (1) a large absolute number of cortical (or pallial) neurons, (2) high neuronal packing density, and (3) high conduction velocities. Primates—and especially humans—optimize all three factors.

Chapter 15: Are Humans Unique?

Roth reviews the evolution of the hominin brain from *Australopithecus* (350–550 cc) through *Homo habilis*, *Homo erectus*, to *Homo sapiens* (1350 cc average) and *Homo neanderthalensis* (1400–1900 cc). The allometric scaling exponent for hominin brain evolution is 1.73—far higher than in any other vertebrate group. Roth suggests that this expansion was not driven primarily by ecological selection pressures but by changes in the genetic regulation of brain development that produced a larger brain as a side effect—an exaptation that then opened up new behavioral possibilities. He concludes that humans are not qualitatively unique in the sense of possessing any cognitive capacity that is completely absent in other animals. Rather, humans possess a unique combination of capacities—large brain, high processing speed, language, long-term planning, prosociality—that are each present in rudimentary form in other animals but have been elaborated to an extraordinary degree in our lineage.

Chapter 17: Brains and Minds

Roth argues that dualism is untenable because it cannot explain mind-brain interaction without violating physical laws. Strong emergentism is problematic because it cannot specify the exact point at which mind "emerges." Reductionism is attractive but faces the "explanatory gap" between first-person and third-person perspectives. Roth proposes a non-reductive physicalism that allows mental properties to be considered "physical" in the sense that they do not violate known physical laws, even if they cannot be reduced to current physical theories. He also expresses sympathy for panpsychism as a way to avoid both dualism and reductionism. The chapter concludes with a discussion of the neural correlates of consciousness, focusing on the importance of recurrent (feedback) connections from higher-order association areas back to primary sensory areas.

V. Major Themes and Contributions

1. The Continuity Thesis. Roth is a Darwinian gradualist. He argues repeatedly that there is no qualitative gap between humans and other animals, only a vast quantitative difference. Every cognitive capacity claimed to be uniquely human—tool use, metacognition, self-awareness, theory of mind, language—has precursors in other animals.

2. The Importance of Comparative Data. Roth draws on an extraordinarily wide range of empirical studies, from bacteria and protozoans through mollusks and arthropods to fish, amphibians, reptiles, birds, and mammals. This comparative breadth allows him to show both the conservation of fundamental mechanisms and the independent evolution of complex cognition in multiple lineages.

3. The Mind-Brain Problem as an Empirical Question. Roth insists

that philosophical questions about the mind can be addressed empirically. By identifying tasks that require consciousness in humans and testing whether animals can perform them, we can make reasonable inferences about animal consciousness.

4. Non-Reductive Physicalism. Roth rejects both dualism and eliminative reductionism, arguing for a position that takes mental states seriously as real properties of organisms while insisting that they are fully dependent on neural activity and do not violate physical laws.

5. The Puzzle of Small-Brained Intelligence. The high cognitive performance of honeybees (about 1 million neurons) and other small-brained animals remains a puzzle. Roth suggests that extremely high neuronal packing density and dendritic computation may play a role, but acknowledges that we still lack a full understanding.

6. Exaptation and Non-Adaptationism. Roth is critical of Panglossian adaptationism, arguing that many features of brains and minds are exaptations: they evolved for other reasons and were later co-opted for new functions.

Key Insights from the Book

1. There is no qualitative gap between human and animal cognition; differences are quantitative, but the quantitative differences are so vast that they produce what we experience as a qualitative gulf.

2. Complex cognition has evolved independently multiple times: in cephalopods, insects (especially bees), birds (corvids, parrots), and mammals (primates, cetaceans, elephants).

3. The best predictors of high cognitive ability are absolute number of cortical neurons, neuronal packing density, and conduction velocity—not raw brain size or encephalization quotient alone.

4. Consciousness can be studied empirically by identifying tasks that require conscious awareness in humans and testing whether animals can perform comparable tasks.

5. Mirror self-recognition (the "mark test") has been demonstrated in great apes, dolphins, elephants, and magpies—but not in many other intelligent species, suggesting multiple forms of self-awareness.

6. The dramatic expansion of the hominin brain was likely an exaptation—a side effect of changes in genetic regulation of brain growth—rather than a direct adaptation for intelligence.

7. Dualism is untenable; non-reductive physicalism or panpsychism are the most plausible philosophical positions on the mind-brain problem.

8. Conscious perception requires recurrent (feedback) connections from higher-order association areas back to primary sensory areas.

9. Despite centuries of research, we still do not fully understand how brains give rise to minds—but the problem is tractable to empirical investigation.

10. The distinction between the physical and the mental is itself a construction of the brain, a distinction that the brain learns to make in early childhood.

VI. Strengths of the Book

Unmatched Scope

No other book in the literature covers the evolution of brains and minds with such breadth and depth. Roth moves seamlessly from molecular biology to philosophy, from bacterial behavior to ape cognition, from octopus neuroanatomy to the neural correlates of consciousness.

Intellectual Honesty

Roth does not shy away from presenting evidence that complicates his own views. He acknowledges unresolved debates and admits when we do not know the answer to important questions.

Philosophical Sophistication

Unlike many neuroscientists who display naive scientism, Roth engages seriously with the philosophical literature and defends a carefully considered position of non-reductive physicalism.

Clear Exposition

Despite the complexity, Roth writes clearly and accessibly. Technical terms are defined when first introduced, and the book is richly illustrated with diagrams and figures.

Up-to-Date Scholarship

The English edition incorporates literature published up to 2012, including recent work on mirror self-recognition in magpies, the evolution of FOXP2, and the debate over avian brain homologies.

VII. Weaknesses and Limitations

The Problem of Consciousness Remains Undertheorized

While Roth provides a sophisticated discussion of the neural correlates of consciousness, he does not fully engage with the "hard problem" as articulated by Chalmers and others. Why should neural activity give rise to subjective experience at all?

Discussion of Artificial Intelligence Is Too Brief

Given Roth's conclusion that mind could in principle be artificially implemented, one would expect a more extended discussion of the

prospects and challenges of AI. The topic is dismissed in a few paragraphs.

Uneven Treatment of Topics

The chapter on sensory systems is extremely detailed, while the chapter on human language is relatively brief. The discussion of primate social cognition is extensive, but social cognition in other animals is less developed.

Not for Beginners

Roth assumes significant background knowledge in neurobiology, evolutionary biology, and philosophy. Undergraduates without prior coursework will struggle.

English Translation Is Occasionally Awkward

There are occasional Germanisms and sentence structures that betray the book's origins, though this does not significantly impede understanding.

VIII. Comparison with Other Works

Jerison (1973), *Evolution of the Brain and Intelligence*. Jerison's classic laid the foundation for quantitative studies of brain evolution. Roth builds on Jerison's work but goes far beyond it, incorporating molecular, cellular, and systems-level neuroscience.

Deacon (1997), *The Symbolic Species*. Deacon focuses on the co-evolution of language and the brain. Roth covers similar ground but is more comprehensive and more cautious about claims of human uniqueness.

Dunbar (2014), *Human Evolution*. Roth engages with Dunbar's "social brain hypothesis" but notes that the correlation between group size and neocortex size is weaker than Dunbar claims.

Herculano-Houzel (2016), *The Human Advantage*. Herculano-Houzel's work on neuronal scaling rules is largely complementary to Roth's account; Roth cites her extensively.

IX. Recommendations and Final Verdict

For neuroscientists: This book will broaden your perspective, reminding you that the human brain is one product of a long evolutionary history.

For evolutionary biologists: This book will deepen your understanding of how natural selection—and other factors—shape the evolution of nervous systems and cognition.

For philosophers: This book will ground your speculations about the

mind-brain problem in empirical reality.

For graduate students: This book is an invaluable resource for comprehensive exams and for developing a research program in evolutionary neuroscience or comparative cognition.

For advanced undergraduates: Challenging but accessible to motivated students with background in biology and psychology.

Final Verdict

Rating: 9/10 (Essential for specialists; highly recommended for advanced students; too technical for general readers.)

Evolution of Brains and Minds is a masterwork. It is not perfect—the discussion of consciousness could be deeper, the treatment of AI is too brief, and the English translation is occasionally awkward—but its strengths far outweigh its weaknesses. For anyone who wants to understand how brains and minds have evolved, and what makes the human mind special (but not unique), this book is essential reading.

References

Roth, G. (2013). *Evolution of Brains and Minds*. Springer. DOI: 10.1007/978-94-007-6265-2

Deacon, T. W. (1997). *The Symbolic Species: The Co-evolution of Language and the Brain*. W.W. Norton.

Dunbar, R. I. M. (2014). *Human Evolution*. Pelican Books.

Herculano-Houzel, S. (2016). *The Human Advantage: A New Understanding of How Our Brain Became Remarkable*. MIT Press.

Jerison, H. J. (1973). *Evolution of the Brain and Intelligence*. Academic Press.

Roth, G., & Dicke, U. (2005). Evolution of the brain and intelligence. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, 9(5), 250–257.